

Establishing Vocal Lineage: A.E. Floyd and the Voice Production of the Choirboys of St Paul's Cathedral Melbourne, 1915–1947

Ian Burk

Alfred Ernest Floyd arrived in Melbourne from the UK to take charge of the music at St Paul's Cathedral in February 1915. He remained there until 1947 when he resigned at the age of 70. In my investigation of the work of Floyd at St Paul's, one of the things that caught my interest was the number of comments made by people (many still alive) concerning the tone and expertise of the trebles (boys) of the Cathedral Choir, which enjoyed considerable fame during Floyd's reign. It met with approbation from such people as Melba, Percy Grainger and Monsignor Rella (conductor of the Sistine Chapel Choir).¹ The sound of the boys was something unusual not only for Australia, but also when compared with other cathedral choirs in the English-speaking world.

Floyd was never a choirboy at a cathedral. He was the son of a Methodist minister and would have had a strong grounding in hymnody. Choirs in Methodist churches consisted generally of adults, men and women, which sang a repertoire largely based on choruses from oratorios. Floyd may well have sung as a treble at his school, although we have no record of this. It is therefore likely that he gained or absorbed his ideas and expertise from the people with whom he trained and from the choirs with which he worked. This article will attempt to examine these influences and ascertain whether a tradition or lineage can be established from which Floyd developed his own ideas, ideas that manifested themselves in the tone production of the choirboys of St Paul's in Melbourne.

The musical foundation at St Paul's was modelled on the English cathedral tradition, with elaborate music sung by a choir of professional men, known as lay clerks, (altos—sometimes called counter-tenors, tenors and basses) and boy trebles. The training of the choir was, and still is, part of the duties of the organist. The boys were educated at the Cathedral Choir School. This was situated first in the Cathedral buildings, then in East Melbourne until 1929, when it

¹ For Melba, see 'Musicians I have Known,' 9 October 1964, ABC Radio Archives, 72/10/528, MU 39, script in Floyd Collection, Grainger Museum, University of Melbourne (hereafter GM/Floyd). For Grainger, see letter from Grainger to Floyd, 3 November 1926, in GM/Floyd. For Rella, see Gibson Young, 'St Paul's Cathedral, Melbourne: Its Architecture and Musical Traditions,' *Australian Musical News* 11.12 (July 1922): 515-19; 'Boy Choristers Impress,' [Melbourne] *Herald* 16 June 1922.

was moved and incorporated into Trinity Grammar School, Kew. From the opening of the Cathedral in 1891 until the present day, the choir has rehearsed and sung daily (except Saturdays). On weekdays the late afternoon sung service is Evensong, a set order of service, but where the music changes daily. The repertoire is therefore very extensive. The performance of such music requires not only vocal expertise but also the ability to read efficiently at sight.

This environment was not foreign to Floyd. Until he became Director of Music at Melbourne Church of England Girls' Grammar School in 1917, which involved taking singing classes one day per week in addition to his Cathedral duties, he had been occupied in the United Kingdom (along with other musical activities) primarily with the training of boys' voices—in cathedral, church and school. One factor that may have been influential in the development of the tone he elicited from the cathedral boys was the sound he inherited when he arrived to take up the appointment at St Paul's. An article published a month after Floyd's arrival in Melbourne begins,

The virility of the voices, and a certain striking absence of inertia that overcomes some of the English choirs, are the two things which have impressed [Mr A.E. Floyd,] the newly appointed organist and choirmaster of St Paul's Cathedral.²

Evidently Floyd was impressed by what he heard, or perhaps he was being diplomatic. To refine and change completely the sound of a group of choirboys takes at least one complete generation of boys, normally from five to seven years. Ingrained habits of a group, especially those of the senior boys, and to some extent of the younger boys who imitate them, take time to change, especially when choirboys are performing daily. However whatever changes Floyd may have made to the choirboys' tone after he arrived in 1915, the 'virility' remained.

Floyd, however, brought another dimension to the training of choirboys. He himself had studied singing with Gustave Garcia,³ and was qualified as a teacher of singing.⁴ This was unusual for a cathedral organist. The distinction between training a choir and teaching singing needs to be drawn. Most cathedral organists, although choir trainers, were not trained singers. By the time Floyd arrived in Melbourne, he had the confidence to develop not only choral technique but voice production as well.

Unfortunately, there are no recordings of the choir of St Paul's under Floyd's direction. Proposals to make a commercial recording in 1928 and a sound film of the choir in 1930 came to nothing. The former was not pursued because of the small percentage of royalties that the Cathedral would have received.⁵ Although Evensong was broadcast live on the ABC every Thursday afternoon from 29 July 1932 until after Floyd's resignation at the end of June 1947, no recordings of these broadcasts were made. At that time, apart from the use of gramophone discs, all broadcasting was live to air. Interest in preserving programs for posterity was not yet ABC policy and had not yet entered the national psyche. The technology of tape recording

² 'New Organist for St. Paul's,' *Australian Musical News* 4 (1915) 235.

³ Alfred E. Floyd, 'Music in Australian Schools,' *Australian Musical News* 1 September 1917. Gustave Garcia (1837–1925), son of Manuel II (1805–1906) was a successful operatic baritone and a teacher of singing on the staff of the Royal Academy of Music and the Royal College of Music, London. See Percy Scholes, *Concise Oxford Dictionary of Music* (London: OUP, 1952) 219.

⁴ Floyd became an Associate of the Royal College of Music in the Teaching of Singing in 1913.

⁵ St Paul's Cathedral Chapter Minutes, vol. 2, 7 June 1928: 281; 6 September 1928: 288; 6 June 1930: 305.

was still being developed at the time. Acetate discs or wire recordings were used for any program material that was pre-recorded, but this was an expensive and uncertain technology, and special permission for this had to be obtained from the ABC hierarchy. Tape recorders for domestic use were not produced until the 1950s.

In the absence of recordings, the only evidence we have of Floyd's choir is written or verbal; from reports in the press, from visiting musicians, from those still alive who remember the sound of the choir, and from former choirboys who sang in the choir. The most reliable of the latter is John Nicholls, a choirboy from 1927–1933 and subsequently Floyd's pupil and assistant. In a very comprehensive document giving his recollections of Floyd, Nicholls wrote that the

tone of the boys was bright and very rounded. It was not a 'hooting' or a sweet delicate tone. It was full, round tone. Over-singing was discouraged. I remember AEF moving up and down the stalls during rehearsals in the Cathedral, trying to quieten down boys if they were singing too loud or harshly. New boys sometimes had to be restrained when copying or trying to emulate the older boy to whom each was attached. There were 14 boys to each side I think, 28 boys in all.⁶

The comments of distinguished musicians, especially those visiting from overseas, is significant. Unlike Melburnians who would have become used to the sound of the choir, these visiting musicians were hearing the choir afresh and were able to draw comparisons with what they had heard elsewhere. Those who heard the choir at St Paul's referred to the tone of the boys in the press and in letters to Floyd. Sydney Nicholson (sometime organist of Westminster Abbey) was impressed by the choir's 'most brilliant tone and fine technique.'⁷ Percy Buck (another English cathedral organist) wrote, 'The boys have real cathedral tone.'⁸ Presumably it was 'understood' what was meant by this, but there is no doubt that it was intended as high praise. Horace Stevens, the singer, wrote, 'I was present at Evensong yesterday, and was so impressed by the purity of the voices (especially those of the boys), the excellent intonation, the careful attention to detail.'⁹ Charles Kitson (an English cathedral organist and academic) wrote, 'The boys' tone is really first rate, and the attention to detail on the part of the choir as a whole is remarkable.'¹⁰ Edgar Bainton reported that he had 'heard Handel's aria "Let the Bright Seraphim" sung by the boys with a brilliance of tone and execution rising at times to virtuosity.'¹¹

It is evident from these remarks that Floyd's trebles were highly trained musically and vocally. It is noteworthy that they combined power and true intonation, attributes of a secure technique. From all accounts, written and verbal, the tone produced by Floyd's trebles at St Paul's was brilliant and virile. It is clear that it did not emulate the 'cool,' lighter tone favoured by the majority of English cathedrals and collegiate foundations, a situation that was not to

⁶ 'John and Jean Nicholls recall Dr A.E. Floyd (AEF) and Life at St Paul's Cathedral, Melbourne,' unpublished document, dated 2 February 2003.

⁷ Sydney H. Nicholson, 'Round the World: At the Antipodes,' *English Church Music* 5.1 (1935): 8-12.

⁸ Letter from Percy Buck to Floyd, 6 June 1937, GM/Floyd.

⁹ Horace Stevens, *Argus* 20 May 1937: 10.

¹⁰ Charles Kitson, *Argus* 28 October 1921: 10.

¹¹ Edgar Bainton, 'A Tour through the Dominions of Canada and Australia,' *Musical Times* 1 March 1931: 219-21.

change in England until George Malcolm took over at Westminster Roman Catholic Cathedral in 1947 and George Guest at St John's College, Cambridge in 1951. They developed a richer sound that came to be known as 'Continental' tone. It was heavier, brighter, and more penetrating.

In a letter to Floyd from John Nicholls, written from London on 11 May 1936, the day he started as Clarke Scholar at the Royal College of Music, he wrote about the choirs at the Temple Church, St Paul's Cathedral and Westminster Abbey. With reference to the Temple Church he wrote,

I don't like the tone of the boys there as much as at Melbourne—it is too effeminate, and at times they verge on a tremolo! Still, in a meek and mild, lady-like, and polite way, the music there is very, very good.¹²

Where did Floyd get his inspiration or ideas on the training of boys' voices, and on which tradition did he draw? Why did he develop a brilliance of tone that was not characteristic of English cathedral choirs at the time when he himself had been part of that tradition?

In order to answer these questions, a survey of the influences that shaped Floyd as a cathedral musician in the United Kingdom before he migrated to Australia follows. In the nineteenth century and in the first half of the twentieth, the majority of English cathedral choir trainers tended to cultivate in their trebles 'a refined, quiet tone' in order to establish and maintain pitch, and to concentrate on developing the so-called 'head register.' They avoided putting voices under pressure for fear of encouraging poor intonation. This kind of tone was often disparagingly described by its detractors as the 'cathedral hoot.' The dictum 'untunefulness, in ninety-nine cases out of a hundred, can be cured by pianissimo singing'¹³ was probably so ingrained that choir trainers were loath to go any further. Prevention rather than the cure became the norm. It was not an unattractive sound however.

The alternative seems to have been what was known as 'chest' tone, a type of voice production that came naturally but which, although powerful, could also sound rough and ready or 'throaty.' There was also a risk of poor intonation with this type of voice production. In the middle of the nineteenth century, the American musician, Lovell Mason, visited many English cathedrals and in *Musical Letters from Abroad, 1854*, commented on 'the terrible roughness of the boys' voices.'¹⁴ In 1900 another American, Miles Farrow, who had also visited many English cathedrals, wrote,

One would suppose that in England, the 'home of the boy choir,' there would be some uniformity in training the boy voice, but there is, to my mind, a deplorable lack of it, and the really satisfactory and finished renditions that one naturally is led to look for over the country, are found in comparatively few of the choirs. ... As regards the boys, there seems to be as much diversity of opinion in the matter of voice production as there is here in our own country, and the merits of 'chest' and 'head' tones are warmly argued and discussed, each system having its ardent supporters.¹⁵

¹² Letter, 11 May 1936, GM/Floyd.

¹³ Charles Moody, *The Choir-Boy in the Making*, 2nd ed. (London: OUP, 1939) 13.

¹⁴ Percy Scholes, 'Cathedral Music,' *The Oxford Companion to Music*, 9th ed. (London: OUP, 1955) 162.

¹⁵ Percy Scholes, *The Mirror of Music, 1844–1944* (London: Novello/OUP, 1947), vol. 2, 531.

W.H. Cummings, recalling his time as a chorister at St Paul's, London in the 1840s, observed that 'he was taught the music used in the Cathedral service, but his voice was left to grow, no special instructions being given as to its use or abuse.'¹⁶ As already mentioned, cathedral choirs were generally trained by musicians who were primarily organists, and in many cases, composers. They employed the techniques that they had learned as an apprentice to one adept in the art of choir training and conducting, or to which they had been subjected as choristers themselves.

The latter was not the case with Floyd. He came into contact with the English cathedral tradition at the age of thirteen-and-a-half when his family moved to Cambridge. At Cambridge this tradition was practised at certain university college chapels, notably King's, St John's and Trinity. By 1890 the choir of King's College Chapel was generally acknowledged as the finest exponent of English cathedral music in the United Kingdom. The choir was trained by Arthur Henry Mann (1850–1929), who was also the Organist. Mann was also in charge of the chapel music at the Leys School where Floyd was a pupil. This probably explains how Floyd came into contact with him and why he studied the organ with him. It is not known whether Floyd's involvement with Mann at King's was restricted to simply having organ lessons. However, given Floyd's talent, youthful enthusiasm and natural desire to absorb as much as possible from Mann's expertise, it is reasonable to speculate that he took every opportunity to observe Mann's work—his organ playing, accompanying and choir training. Floyd described Mann as 'a genius of a choirmaster.'¹⁷ What then did Floyd learn from Mann regarding the training of boys' voices?

It is instructive at this point to examine Mann's own training. He was trained as a choirboy by Zechariah Buck,¹⁸ organist of Norwich Cathedral from 1819–1877, and regarded as the most outstanding trainer of cathedral choirboys' voices in England in the nineteenth century. According to his biographer, F.G. Kitton, he 'adopted every conceivable plan likely to be productive of good results.'¹⁹ Each boy was trained to possess a virtuoso singing technique and the solo boys were especially famous. His system of teaching the art of singing 'was based upon the methods of the best contemporary Italian masters.'²⁰ Whenever one of these visited England, Buck would ascertain from him his particular system of instruction and even take lessons himself 'in order to discover the special means employed.' From each of these he gained ideas that he adopted to suit his own purposes and which he considered would achieve the best results. He imposed on his choirboys a rigorous regime of daily rehearsals and training in the development of voice production.²¹ His methods were unconventional. For example, according to a recent monograph,

¹⁶ *Musical Times* 1 February 1907. Also in Scholes, *Mirror of Music*, vol. 2, 530.

¹⁷ A.E. Floyd, 'Musicians I have Known,' ABC, 9 October 1964. Script in GM/Floyd.

¹⁸ Buck taught A.H. Mann, himself a chorister at Norwich. He had an outstanding reputation as a choir trainer, particularly of boys' voices. See Frederick George Kitton, ed., *Zechariah Buck: A Centenary Memoir* (London: Jarrold, 1899); Harold Watkins Shaw, *The Succession of Organists of the Chapel Royal and the Cathedrals of England and Wales from c. 1538* (Oxford: OUP, 1991).

¹⁹ Kitton, *Zechariah Buck* 9.

²⁰ Kitton, *Zechariah Buck* 4.

²¹ According to Edward Bunnett, one of Buck's choristers, Buck sacrificed everything else to music, the boys' education especially. They practised for an hour at 7.00 am, then after breakfast for an hour before the 10 o'clock service, and two hours more during the day, beside receiving musical instruction from one of the lay clerks. Unidentified cutting pasted into the cover of a book entitled *Choralia* in GM/Floyd.

to get the boys to open their mouths properly he would force in an assortment of objects such as nuts, marbles, beans or acorns. He developed this idea further by getting a local builder ... to make a number of shaped wooden mouthpieces which would fit between the upper and lower teeth ... The mouthpieces were handed out at morning exercises and each boy was given a looking-glass to check that it had been properly inserted.²²

The mouthpieces were shaped like the segment of an orange and were hollow, with grooves for the teeth on the exterior surfaces. Mann apparently found the daily regime so gruelling that he was glad when his voice broke.²³ According to Mann, Buck would never permit the boys to force their voices.²⁴ Towards the end of his time as a chorister Mann was apprenticed to Buck and was required to teach the choirboys as he himself had been taught.²⁵ One might therefore conclude that Mann probably used similar techniques in training the choirboys of King's College Chapel, Cambridge. Also, given that Floyd studied with Mann it might be expected that some of the 'Buck tradition' rubbed off on him. This may have been the case so far as rehearsal techniques were concerned, but not with voice production.

The literature dealing with Mann's work is not extensive. The most comprehensive account of Mann's choir training comes from Seiriol Evans, who began as a chorister under Mann at King's in 1905 and returned as a choral scholar in 1913. In 1960 he wrote,

Dr. Mann's method of training his boys had, of course, much in common with the methods of any other choir trainer—that is, he relied on the imitative capacity of the musical boy, but he stimulated this quality in a systematic way. ... His ideas about voice production were (like those of other organists I have known) quite elementary. He was always saying 'I want a good round tone' and he would insist on getting this from choral scholars as well as from boys; but there was no training in scientific voice production at all. Mann was an empiricist in this ... and he went the most direct way to get it. But there was more than this behind his insistence. He had quickly realised that a choir singing in the College Chapel must be able to meet the acoustic conditions provided by the building.²⁶

This is the key to the way Mann trained the boys at King's. The chapel at King's has an extremely live acoustic, and a long echo. This means that loud singing (especially if coupled with the use of the organ) can result in a confusion of sound and a loss of clarity, especially in regard to diction. It also becomes impossible for singers to hear each other. For this reason, according to Evans, Mann assiduously cultivated a guarded singing tone,

not caring if it distorted vowel sounds, and perhaps in ignorance of the harm it did to voice production. None of the choral scholars of those days learned to throw the voice forward. Those who went to singing teachers who tried to correct this fault were promptly checked if they dared to sing with a more open tone.²⁷

²² Tom Roast, *Zechariah Buck: Organist of Norwich Cathedral 18919–1877* (Norwich: Gateway Music, 1998) 16.

²³ Roast, *Zechariah Buck* 5.

²⁴ A.H. Mann, 'Recollections of Dr. Buck,' *Zechariah Buck*, ed. F.G. Kitton, 71.

²⁵ Mann, 'Recollections' 73–74.

²⁶ Seiriol John Arthur Evans, 'A Victorian Choirmaster: Dr. A.H. Mann,' *Church Music Society Fifty-fourth Annual Report* (1960): 9–15 at 11–12.

²⁷ Evans, 'Victorian Choirmaster' 12.

In 1898 Floyd went to Winchester to become assistant organist at Winchester Cathedral and the 'articled pupil' or apprentice to the Cathedral organist, George Benjamin Arnold (1832–1902). Arnold was the pupil and chosen successor of Samuel Sebastian Wesley, generally regarded as one of the most significant figures of cathedral music in England in the nineteenth century. However, it would appear that Arnold himself had gained little from Wesley in the area of training the boy choristers. According to the Wesley scholar, Peter Horton, 'all the evidence suggests that Wesley himself had no great interest in choir training and was more than happy for one of his assistants/apprentices to look after this for him.'²⁸ This view is supported by Donald Webster in his account of the music at Leeds Parish Church, where Wesley was organist before moving to Winchester Cathedral. Wesley's fame was due to his skill as an organist, both as a service and a solo player. It was generally acknowledged that he was not a good choir trainer. For much of Wesley's time at Leeds, the instruction of the boys and men was in the hands of a separate choirmaster.²⁹ At Winchester, as Wesley's pupil, Arnold was most likely one of those apprentices given responsibility for training the choir. In that case, on what, if anything, did he model his training of the boys? Arnold subsequently appears to have followed Wesley's practice of delegating the responsibility of training the boys, when he himself was Organist of Winchester Cathedral. According to Floyd,

In my day at Winchester I ... began the choristers' practice at nine o'clock (that went on till quarter to ten) ... Mine was a curious situation, because the very able old man who was organist at the cathedral, had been an organist so long that he was bored to death with the whole thing and left as much as ever he possibly could to me.³⁰

No present-day assistant organist at a cathedral would enjoy such freedom and have virtual control over the training of the choirboys. According to Floyd's recollections, during the morning practices with the boys, Arnold sat at the back of the practice room 'in a posture of sleep.'³¹ One could deduce from this that Arnold contributed little to Floyd's development as a choir trainer. There appears to be no account of the state of the choir at Winchester during Floyd's time there, although, in 1901, not long after Floyd's departure, there was a report in *The Musical Times*, which mentioned 'the excellent singing of the boys being a marked feature of ... Evensong.'³² Given that the turnover of personnel in a statutory cathedral choir is gradual and not great, the 'excellent singing of the boys' may perhaps have been a legacy of Floyd's work. Floyd and his work appear to have impressed the Dean of Winchester who, just over a year after Floyd had left Winchester, offered to procure for him the organistship of Chichester Cathedral. It would appear that Floyd made use of the opportunity afforded him at Winchester to actually practise the art of training boys' voices.

In the last two decades of the nineteenth century, there was increased interest in the training of boys' voices, and in the 1890s, during Floyd's time at Cambridge and Winchester, handbooks

²⁸ Letter to Ian Burk, 7 February 2002.

²⁹ Donald Webster, *Parish' Past and Present: 275 Years of Leeds Parish Church Music* (Leeds: Leeds Parish Church, 1988) 29–30.

³⁰ 'An Organist's Life,' interview with Floyd conducted by John Thompson for the ABC, recorded in September 1959 and first broadcast by the ABC on 28 March 1960. ABC Radio Archives, 72/10/500, F/D49. Script in GM/Floyd.

³¹ William F. Chappell, 'A.E. Floyd,' *Australian Journal of Music Education* (October 1973): 15–19.

³² 'A Visit to Winchester,' *Musical Times* 1 November 1901: 722.

on this subject began to appear.³³ Many churches were advertising for boy soloists. In 1892, George Martin, organist of St Paul's Cathedral, London, published *The Art of Training Choir Boys* along with a separate volume of exercises, and John Varley Roberts, organist at Magdalen College, Oxford, from 1882 until 1920, published in 1898 *A Treatise on a Practical Method of Training Choristers*. The choir of Magdalen College, Oxford, along with King's College, Cambridge, and St. Paul's Cathedral, London, were reputed to be the best in 1900.³⁴ Among the treatises on choir training in Floyd's personal library is an annotated copy of *Voice Culture for Children: A Practical Primer on the Cultivation and Preservation of Young Voices, with Exercises for the Use of Schools, Choirs, Solo-Boys, etc.* by James Bates.³⁵ It would appear that Floyd used this popular manual in England, probably at Oswestry, since the publication date is 1907. Some of the exercises he continued to use at St Paul's Cathedral, Melbourne.³⁶

But were Floyd's musical background and training the only factors that contributed to the cultivation of the type of tone for which the boys at St Paul's, Melbourne became famous? The inspiration may well have come from two passages that Floyd marked in his personal copy of *The Life of Sir F.A. Gore Ouseley* by F.W. Joyce, published in 1896. Floyd's name is written inside the cover and the style of his handwriting indicates that Floyd procured his copy soon after it was published. In the fly-leaf, Floyd also wrote an index to these passages (one example in his index reads, '76 boys' voices—English v. Dresden') no doubt so that he could refer to them easily. The passages are quotations from letters written by Ouseley to the Reverend J.W. Joyce during Ouseley's tour of continental Europe. From Dresden on 21 October 1851 he wrote:

I am quite out of conceit with English Chorister boys. I think every Precentor and Choir Master ought to come and hear the boys here, both in the Roman Catholick and in the Lutheran Church. I never heard anything equal or approaching to the excellence of their voices. The intonation is so true, and the style so tasteful and refined, and the quality so rich and full and round, that it leaves nothing to be desired. I wish I could catch a Saxon lad and import him! But I fear this is impossible. I assure you, I am 'all agog' about this matter.³⁷

In a subsequent letter from Berlin on 28 October 1851, Ouseley wrote again on the subject of boys' voices.

I think in my last letter I told you about the boys' voices at Dresden. Well, at Leipzig, at the Thomaskirche, they are well nigh as good. I wish I could capture one! I am quite certain I shall never care for English Cathedral trebles again. I assure you it is worth any musician's while to come to Dresden or Leipzig from any part of the world, if it were only to hear these boys. You never in your life heard anything approaching it. ... I suspect they are chosen from a somewhat higher class of Society than our own choristers usually are; and this is perhaps the cause of their more refined style.³⁸

³³ Paul Yeats-Edwards, *English Church Music: A Bibliography* (London: White Lion, 1975) 168–72.

³⁴ Scholes, *The Mirror of Music*, vol. 2, 531.

³⁵ In GM/Floyd.

³⁶ Personal interview with John Nicholls, pupil and later assistant to Floyd at St Paul's Cathedral, 23 April 1996 and 7 June 1997.

³⁷ Frederick Wayland Joyce, *The Life of Rev. Sir F.A.G. Ouseley, Bart.* [incl. G.R. Sinclair. *Sir Frederick Ouseley as a Musician* and J.S. Bumpus, *The Compositions of the Rev. Sir Frederick A. Gore Ouseley, Bt.* (London: 1892 and 1896, rev.)] (London: Methuen, 1896) 76.

³⁸ Joyce, *Sir F.A.G. Ouseley* 77.

Ouseley's descriptors: true intonation, tasteful and refined style, and rich, full round tone, were hall-marks of the tone produced by Floyd's trebles at St Paul's, Melbourne. What is remarkable, however, is the fact that Floyd's boys were largely drawn from middle-class or working-class environments and not from the 'somewhat higher class of Society' surmised by Ouseley as the reason for the superiority of the Dresden and Leipzig boys.

Coupled with the possible influence of the comments of Ouseley, there remain three aspects of Floyd's practice, all related, which may be traced back to A.H. Mann. The first is to do with the acoustics. Unlike King's College Chapel, the acoustic of St Paul's Cathedral Melbourne, though spacious, has little reverberation. Guarded, soft tone, so apt for King's College Chapel, would be out of place and simply would not carry in St Paul's. Floyd, like Mann at King's, would have encouraged a type of voice production to suit the acoustic properties of the building. In order for the sound to carry in St Paul's, a bright full tone is required. Like his predecessor at St Paul's, Floyd cultivated a virile, rich tone to achieve this. However, like Mann he also insisted on 'round tone,' that is, a full sound without any hint of uncontrolled chest tone or harshness. Coupled with this was tonal restraint; the avoidance of forced tone, which can so easily upset the blend of the voices and lead to faulty intonation. That he was able to achieve this and maintain the musical refinement mentioned by Ouseley and by those who so admired 'Floyd's flock' (as his boys were called) and fill the building with sound is probably due to number of boys in the choir: twenty-eight—almost double that of most English cathedral and collegiate choirs.

Floyd's achievements in choir training, and in training the boys in particular, were clearly due to his personality, musical enthusiasm, skill, discipline. The fact that Floyd had taken lessons in voice production, following the example of Zechariah Buck, no doubt contributed to the results he obtained. Floyd was passionate about music and its power to transform people's lives, as listeners and performers. He considered the voice to be the natural musical instrument and the use of it to be the gateway to the enjoyment of music. In all his articles and talks on music education he stressed the importance of singing, a view he held in common with the music appreciation movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. He knew that in order to produce a thrilling musical effect, the voice had to be used and trained as any other musical instrument. That was his primary concern at the cathedral and at the various schools in which he worked and with which he had contact. There is no reason to suppose that he did not train the boys to sing with the same poise, refinement of taste, and musical passion and vigour that characterised his own organ playing.